

Select Bibliography

ASKO TIMONEN

This bibliography of modern books and articles has been compiled on the basis of the following themes associated with the concept of cruelty: violence, ruling power, tyranny, barbarism, political propaganda and historiography. Most of the studies here mentioned have been of considerable value in contributing to the present volume.

- Adam, T., *Clementia Principis. Der Einfluß hellenistischer Fürstenspiegel auf den Versuch einer rechtlichen Fundierung des Principats durch Seneca*, Kieler Historische Studien 11, hrsg. von H. Braunert et al. (Stuttgart 1970).
- Alföldy, G., *Septimius Severus und der Senat*, Bonner Jahrbücher 168 (1968) 112–160.
- Arens, W., *The Original Sin: Incest and Its Meaning* (New York–Oxford 1986).
- Ariès, P., *Western Attitudes towards Death: From the Middle Ages to the Present* [original French version, 1975] (Baltimore–London 1974).
- Backhaus, W., *Der Hellenen-Barbaren-Gegensatz und die Hippokratische Schrift *Peri aéron hudáton tópon**, *Historia* 25 (1976) 170–185.
- Bacon, H. H., *Barbarians in Greek Tragedy* (New Haven 1961).
- Baslez, M.-F., *L'Étranger dans la Grèce antique* (Paris 1984).
- Bengston, H., *Hellenen und Barbaren: Gedanken zum Problem des griechischen Nationalbewußtseins*, in: K. Rüdinger (ed.), *Unser Geschichtsbild* (Munich 1954) 25–40 [Reprinted in: *Kleine Schriften* (Munich 1974) 158–173].
- Boer, W. den, *La "damnatio memoriae" des empereurs et la religion romaine*, in: *Transformation et conflits au IV^e siècle après J. C.*, *Antiquitas* Band 29 (Bonn 1978) 217–224.
- Borresen, K. E., *Subordination et équivalence: Nature et rôle de la femme d'après Augustin et Thomas d'Aquin* (Oslo–Paris 1968).

- Borst, A., *Medieval Worlds. Barbarians, Heretics and Artists in the Middle Ages*, transl. by E. Hansen (Cambridge 1991) [German original: *Barbaren, Ketzler und Artisten* (Munich 1988)].
- Bucheit, V., Chrysogonus als Tyrann in Ciceros Rede für Roscius aus Ameria, *Chiron* 5 (1975) 193–211.
- Burian, J., Der Gegensatz zwischen Rom und den Barbaren in der *Historia Augusta*, *Eirene* 15 (1977) 55–96.
- Burkert, W., *Homo Necans*: Interpretationen altgriechischer Opferriten und Mythen, *Religionsgeschichtliche Versuche und Vorarbeiten* 32 (Berlin–New York 1972).
- , Greek Tragedy and sacrificial ritual, *Greek, Roman and Byzantine Studies* 7 (1966) 87–121.
- , *Structure and History in Greek Mythology and Ritual* (Berkeley–Los Angeles–London 1975).
- Brecht, C. H., *Perduellio* (Munich 1936).
- Brunet, H., *L'Image du Monde byzantin en France au Siècle des Lumières* (Toulouse 1987).
- Cantarella, E., Per una preistoria del castigo, in: *Du châtiment dans la cité. Supplices corporels et peine de mort dans le monde antique. Table Ronde organisée par l'École française de Rome avec le concours du Centre national de la recherche scientifique* (Rome 9–11 novembre 1982), *Collection de l'École française de Rome* [from now on CEFR] 79 (Rome 1984) 37–73.
- , I supplizi capitali in Grecia e a Roma (Milan 1991).
- Callu, J. P., Le jardin des supplices au Bas-Empire, in: *Du châtiment dans la cité. Supplices corporels et peine de mort dans le monde antique*, CEFR 79 (Rome 1984) 313–359.
- Chantraine, H., Der tote Herrscher in der Politik der römischen Kaiserzeit, *Geschichte in Wissenschaft und Unterricht* 39 (1988) 67–80.
- Charlesworth, M. P., The Virtues of a Roman Emperor. Propaganda and the Creation of Belief, *Proceedings of the British Academy* 23 (1937) 105–133.
- Cizek, E., Le mort de Vitellius dans les “Vies des Douze Césars” de Suétone, *Revue des Études Anciennes* 77 (1975) 125–130.
- Classen, C. J., *Virtutes Imperatoriae*, *Arctos* 25 (1991) 17–40.

- Coleman, K. M., *Fatal Charades: Roman Executions Staged as Mythological Enactments*, *Journal of Roman Studies* 80 (1990) 44–73.
- Cornell, T., *Some Observations on the crimen incesti*, in: *Le délit religieux dans la cité antique. Table Ronde, Rome, 6–7 avril 1978*, CEFR 48 (1981) 27–37.
- Coroi, J., *La Violence en droit criminel romain* (Paris 1915).
- Cracco Ruggini, L., *Pregiudizi razziali, ostilità politica e culturale, intolleranza religiosa nell'impero romano*, *Athenaeum* 46 (1968) 139–152.
- , 'De morte persecutorum' e polemica antibarbarica nella storiografia pagana e cristiana, *Rivista di Storia e Letteratura religiosa* 4 (1968), 433 ff.
- , *Pagani, ebrei e cristiani: Odio sociologico e odio teologico nel mondo antico*, in: *XXVI Sett. di Studi del Centro italiano di studi sull'Alto Medioevo: Gli ebrei nell'Alto Medioevo* (30 marzo–5 aprile 1978), vol. 1 (Spoleto 1980) 15–117.
- , *Intolerance: Equal and less Equal in the Roman World*, *Classical Philology* 82 (1987) 187–205.
- Cunliffe, B., *Greeks, Romans and Barbarians: Spheres of Interaction* (London 1988).
- Daube, D., *Ne quid infamandi causa fiat – The Roman law of defamation*, *Atti del Congresso Internazionale di Diritto Romano 1948* (Milan 1953) 413 ff.
- Dauge, Y. A., *Le Barbare: recherches sur la conception romaine de la barbarie et de la civilisation*, *Coll. Latomus* 176 (Brussels 1981).
- De Mattei, R., *Sul concetto di barbaro e barbarie nel medio evo*, in: *Studi di storia e diritto in onore di Enrico Besta*, vol. 4 (Milan 1939).
- Demougeot, E., *L'Image officielle du barbare dans l'Empire romain d'Auguste à Théodose*, *Ktéma* IX (1984) 123–143.
- Ditten, H., *Barbaroi, Hellenes und Römaioi bei den letzten byzantinischen Geschichtsschreibern*, in: *Actes du XXIème Congrès International des Études byzantines* (Ohrid 1962).
- Dodds, E. R., *The Greeks and the Irrational* (Berkeley 1951).
- Drexler, H., *Politische Grundbegriffe der Römer* (Darmstadt 1988).
- DuBois, P., *Torture and Truth* (New York–London 1991).

- Ducellier, A., *Le Miroir de l'Islam. Musulmans et Chrétiens d'Orient au Moyen Age* (Paris 1971).
- , *Mentalité historique et réalités politiques: L'Islam et les Musulmans vus par les Byzantins du XIIIème siècle*, *Byzantinische Forschungen*, Band IV (1972).
- , *L'Islam et les Musulmans vus de Byzance au XIVème siècle*, *Byzantina XII* (1983) 95–134.
- , *L'Intolérance des pacifiques: réflexions sur le Monde orthodoxe*, in: *Actes du Colloque "Les frontières religieuses aux XVIème et XVIIème siècles"*, Centre d'Études Supérieures de la Renaissance (Tours 1988).
- Fraschetti, A., *Le sepolture rituali del Foro Boario*, in: *Le délit religieux dans la cité antique*, *CEFR* 48 (Rome 1981) 51–115.
- Garner, R., *Law and Society in Classical Athens* (London 1987).
- Gernet, L., *Some Connections between Punishment and Religion in Ancient Greece*, in: *The Anthropology of Ancient Greece*, trans. J. Hamilton and B. Nagy (Baltimore 1981) 240–276.
- , *Le droit pénal de la Grèce ancienne*, in: *Du châtimement dans la cité. Supplices corporels et peine de mort dans le monde antique*, *CEFR* 79 (Rome 1984) 9–35.
- Girard, R., *La Violence et le sacré* (Paris 1972).
- Goff, B. E., *The Noose of Words: Readings of Desire, Violence and Language in Euripides' Hippolytos* (Cambridge 1990).
- Graus, F., *Die Gewalt bei den Anfängen des Feudalismus und die "Gefangenenerbefreiungen" der merowingischen Hagiographie*, *Jahrbuch für Wirtschaftsgeschichte* (1961) 60–156.
- Grodzinski, D., *Tortures mortelles et catégories sociales. Les *summa supplicia* dans le droit romain aux IIIe et IVe siècles*, in: *Du châtimement dans la cité. Supplices corporels et peine de mort dans le monde antique*, *CEFR* 79 (Rome 1984) 361–403.
- Grottanelli, C. – Parise, N. F. (ed.), *Sacrificio e società nel mondo antico* (Bari 1988).
- Gruber, J. – Vismara, G., 'Barbaren', in: *Lexikon des Mittelalters*, vol. 1 (Munich–Zurich 1980) 1434–1436.
- Friedman, J. B., *The Monstrous Races in Medieval Art and Thought* (Cambridge, Mass.–London 1981).

- Fuhrmann, M., Die Alleinherrschaft und das Problem der Gerechtigkeit (Seneca: *De clementia*), in: Prinzipat und Freiheit, hrsg. von R. Klein, Wege der Forschung Band 135 (Darmstadt 1969) 271–320.
- Hall, E., *Inventing the Barbarian. Greek Self-Definition through Tragedy* (Oxford 1989).
- Harsh, P. W., *Deeds of Violence in Greek Tragedy*. Stanford Studies in Language and Literature 1941 (ed. by H. Graig), 59–73.
- Hinard, F., La male mort. Exécutions et statut du corps au moment de la première proscription, in: Du châtement dans la cité. Supplices corporels et peine de mort dans la monde antique, CEFR 79 (Rome 1984) 295–311.
- , Les proscriptions de la Rome républicaine, CEFR 83 (Rome 1985).
- Kieckhefer, R., *European Witch Trials: Their Foundations in Popular and Learned Culture, 1300–1500* (London–Henley 1976).
- Lana, I., *Civilis, civiliter, civilitas* in Tacito e Suetonio, Contributo alla storia del lessico politico romano nell'età imperiale. Atti della Accademia delle Scienze di Torino 106 (1972) 465–487.
- Lassandro, D., La demonizzazione del nemico politico nei Panegyrici Latini, in: Religione e politica nel mondo antica, Contributi dell'Istituto di storia antica 7 (Milan 1981) 237–249.
- Lechner, K., Byzanz und die Barbaren, Saeculum 6 (1955) 292–306.
- Leff, G., *Heresy in the later Middle Ages: The Relation of Heterodoxy to Dissent c. 1250–1450*, 2 vols. (New York 1967).
- Le Goff, J. (ed.), *Hérésies et sociétés dans l'Europe préindustrielle: 11e–18e siècles* (Paris–The Hague 1968).
- Lintott, A. W., *Violence in Republican Rome* (Oxford 1968).
- , *Violence, Civil Strife and Revolution in the Classical City* (London 1982).
- Lourdaux, W. – Verhelst, D. (eds.), *The Concept of Heresy in the Middle Ages (11th–13th Century)* (Louvain–The Hague 1976).
- MacDowell, D. M., *The Law in Classical Athens, Aspects of Greek and Roman Life*, ed. by H. H. Scullard (London 1978).
- MacMullen, R., The Roman Concept Robber-Pretender, *Revue Internationale des Droits de l'Antiquité* 10 (1963) 221–226.

- , Militarism in the Late Antiquity, in: *The End of the Roman Empire. Decline or Transformation*. 2nd ed. D. Kagan (Lexington-Toronto 1978) 114–132.
- , Judicial Savagery in the Roman Empire, *Chiron* 16 (1986) 147–166.
- Maffi, A., Il decreto su Calcide (ML 52) e la repressione penale nella *polis* classica, in: *Du châtement dans la cité. Supplices corporels et peine de mort dans la monde antique*, CEFR 79 (Rome 1984) 429–438.
- Magdelain, A., Paricidas, in: *Du châtement dans la cité. Supplices corporels et peine de mort dans la monde antique*, CEFR 79 (Rome 1984) 549–571.
- Mazzarino, S., La propaganda senatoriale nel tardo impero, *Doxa. Rassegna critica di antichità classica* 4 (1951) 121–148.
- Mommsen, T., *Römisches Strafrecht* (Leipzig 1899).
- Mortureux, B., Les idéaux stoïciens et les premières responsabilités politiques: le “De clementia”, in: *Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt [ANRW]* II 36.3 (1989) 1639–1685.
- Mossé, C., *La tyrannie dans la Grèce antique* (Paris 1969).
- Mouchová, B., Cruditatis principis optimi, *Bonner Historia-Augusta-Colloquium [BHAC]* 1970 (1972) 167–194.
- , “Ignobilitas” Macrini, *Listy Filologicke* 106 (1983) 174–177.
- , Zum literarischen Porträt des Opilius Macrinus in der *Historia Augusta*, *Graecolatina Pragensia, Acta Universitatis Carolinae, Philologica* X 3 (1983) 29–34.
- Opelt, I. – Speyer, W., Barbar, *Jahrbuch für Antike und Christentum* 10 (1967) 251–290.
- Österberg, E. – Lindström, D., Crime and Social Control in Medieval and Early Modern Swedish Towns, *Acta Universitatis Upsaliensis, Studia Historica Upsaliensia* 152 (Uppsala 1988).
- Paschoud, F., Romains et barbares au début du Ve siècle après J. C.: Le témoignage d'Eunape, d'Olympiodore et de Zosime, in: *La nozione di 'Romano' tra cittadinanza e universalità: Da Roma alla terza Roma, Documenti e studi* (Roma, 21–23 aprile 1982), vol. 2 (Naples 1984), 357–367.

- Patlagean, E., Byzance et le blason pénal du corps, in: *Du châtement dans la cité. Supplices corporels et peine de mort dans la monde antique*, CEFR 79 (Rome 1984) 405–427.
- Polverini, L., *Storiografia e Propaganda. La Crisi del III Secolo nella Storiografia Latina del IV*, in: *I canali della propaganda nel mondo antico*, Contributi dell'Istituto di storia antica 4 (Milan 1976) 252–270.
- Preisendanz, K., *Fluchtafel (Defixiones), Reallexicon für Antike und Christentum* 8 (1972) 1–29.
- Ramage, E. S., *Denigration of Predecessor under Claudius, Galba and Vespasian*, *Historia* 32 (1983) 201–214.
- Sanders, L. J., *Dionysius I of Syracuse and Greek Tyranny* (London–New York–Sydney 1987).
- Scarry, E., *The Body in Pain: The Making and Unmaking of the World* (Oxford 1985).
- Scheid, J., *La mort du tyran. Chronique de quelques morts programmées*, in: *Du châtement dans la cité. Supplices corporels et peine de mort dans le monde antique*, CEFR 79 (Rome 1984) 177–193.
- Sherwin-White, A. N., *Violence in Roman Politics*, *Journal of Roman Studies* 46 (1956) 1–9.
- Signori, G., *Gewalt und Frömmigkeit. Die Waadtländer Landschaft im Spiegel Conon von Estavayers Wunderbücher "Unserer Lieben Frau von Lausanne" (1232–1242). Ein Beitrag zur Erforschung hoch- und spätmittelalterlicher Mirakelliteratur*, *Schweizerische Zeitschrift für Geschichte* 40 (1990) 127–152.
- Sirago, V. A., *Italia e Roma nell'ideologia e nella realtà storica del IV secolo*, *Quaderni di Istituto di sc. stor. polit. Facoltà di Magistero dell'Univ. di Bari* (1986) 7–45.
- Southern, R. W., *Western Views of Islam in the Middle Ages* (Harvard–Oxford 1962).
- Springer, F. K., *Tyrannus, Untersuchungen zur politischen Ideologie der Römer*, Diss. Köln 1952.
- Stahl, P. H., *Histoire de la décapitation* (Paris 1986).
- Straub, J., *Vom Herrscherideal in der Spätantike, Forschungen zur Kirchen- und Geistesgeschichte* 18 (Stuttgart 1939).

- Talbert, C.H., *Biographies of Philosophers and Rulers as Instruments of Religious Propaganda in Mediterranean Antiquity*, ANRW II 16.2 (1978) 1619–1651.
- Tenenti, A., *Il senso della morte e l'amore della vita nel Rinascimento* (Torino 1989).
- Van Acker, L., *Barbarus und seine Ableitungen im Mittellatein*, *Archiv für Kulturgeschichte* 47 (1965) 125–140.
- Vazzoler, F., (ed.), *La Maschera del Boia. Testi letterari italiani del XVI e XVII secolo sul carnefice* (Genoa 1982).
- Vittinghoff, F., *Der Staatsfeind in der römischen Kaiserzeit. Untersuchungen zur Damnatio memoriae* (Berlin 1936).
- Voisin, J. L., *Les Romains, chasseurs de têtes*, in: *Du châtiment dans la cité. Supplices corporels et peine de mort dans le monde antique*, CEFR 79 (Rome 1984) 241–293.
- Wallace-Hadrill, A., *The Emperor and His Virtues*, *Historia* 30 (1981) 298–319.
- Wardman, A.E., *Usurpers and Internal Conflicts in the 4th Century A.D.*, *Historia* 33 (1984) 220–237.
- Wickert, L., *Entstehung und Entwicklung des römischen Herrscherideals. Ideologie und Herrschaft in der Antike* (Darmstadt 1979) 339–360.
- Wiedemann, T. E. J., *Between Men and Beasts: Barbarians in Ammianus Marcellinus*, in: *Past Perspectives, Studies in Greek and Roman Historical Writing, Papers presented at a conference in Leeds, 6–8 April 1983*, ed. by I. S. Moxon, J. D. Smart and A. J. Woodman (Cambridge 1986) 189–211.

MEDIUM AEVUM QUOTIDIANUM

HERAUSGEGEBEN VON GERHARD JARITZ

SONDERBAND II

CRUELITAS

The Politics of Cruelty
in the Ancient and Medieval World

Proceedings of the International Conference
Turku (Finland), May 1991

Edited by
Toivo Viljamaa, Asko Timonen
and Christian Krötzl

Krems 1992

Front page illustration: Martyrdom of Saint Barbara (detail),
Friedrich Pacher, Tyrolian, 1480–1490,
Neustift (Novacella), South Tyrol (Italy), Stiftsgalerie

Alle Rechte vorbehalten
– ISBN 3-90 1094 05 9

Herausgeber: Medium Aevum Quotidianum. Gesellschaft zur Erforschung der materiellen Kultur des Mittelalters, Körnermarkt 13, A-3500 Krems, Österreich – Druck: KOPITU Ges. m. b. H., Wiedner Hauptstraße 8–10, A-1050 Wien.

Contents

Preface	7
Andrew LINTOTT (Oxford): Cruelty in the Political Life of the Ancient World	9
Maarit KAIMIO (Helsinki): Violence in Greek Tragedy	28
Toivo VILJAMAA (Turku): "Crudelitatis odio in crudeli- tatem ruitis". Livy's Concept of Life and History	41
Katariina MUSTAKALLIO (Helsinki): The "crimen in- cesti" of the Vestal Virgins and the Prodigious Pestilence	56
Asko TIMONEN (Turku): Criticism of Defense. The Blam- ing of "Crudelitas" in the "Historia Augusta"	63
Christer BRUUN (Helsinki): Water as a Cruel Element in the Roman World	74
Luigi de ANNA (Turku): Elogio della crudeltà. Aspetti della violenza nel mondo antico e medievale	81
Greti DINKOVA-BRUUN (Helsinki): Cruelty and the Me- dieval Intellectual: The Case of Peter Abelard	114
Christian KRÖTZL (Tampere): "Crudeliter afflicta". Zur Darstellung von Gewalt und Grausamkeit in mitttelalter- lichen Mirakelberichten	121

Thomas LINDKVIST (Uppsala): The Politics of Violence and the Transition from Viking Age to Medieval Scandi- navia	139
Alain DUCELLIER (Toulouse): Byzance, Juge Cruel dans un Environnement Cruel? Notes sur le "Musulman cruel" dans l'Empire byzantin entre VIIème et XIIIème siècles	148
Asko TIMONEN (Turku): Select Bibliography	181

Preface

The present volume is a collection of the papers read at the conference which was held in May 1991 at the University of Turku on the theme *The Politics of Cruelty in the Ancient and Medieval World*. The general aim of the conference was to advance interdisciplinary and international collaboration in the fields of humanistic studies and particularly to bring together scholars who have common interests in the study of our past. The choice of the subject of cruelty naturally resulted from different study projects concerning the political and social history of late antiquity and the Middle Ages – the Roman imperial propaganda, the conflict between paganism and christianity, the history of the Vandals, the Byzantine empires, the Medieval miracle stories, to name some of them. Perhaps also contemporary events had an influence on the idea that cruelty could be the theme which conveniently would unite those various interests. And the idea emerged irrespective of considerations whether or not we should search for models in the Ancient World or join those who, as it seems to have been a fashion, insist on investigating what we have common with the Middle Ages.

One might argue – and for a good reason indeed – that cruelty is a subject for anthropologists and psychologists, not for philologists and historians. Where does the student of history find reliable criteria for defining the notion of cruelty in order to judge the men of the past and their actions, to charge with cruelty not only individuals but also nations and even ages (“the *crudelitas imperatorum*”, “the Dark Ages”, “the violence of the Vikings”, “the cruel Muslims”)? Is it not so that the only possibility is to adapt our modern sensibilities to the past and to use our own prejudices in making judgements about others? The prejudices – yes, but this is just what makes the theme interesting for the historian because our prejudices – our conception of cruelty, for instance – are part of the heritage of past centuries. The events of our own day – maybe more clearly than ever – have demonstrated that we live in a historical world. When we investigate the history of the concept of cruelty we, as it were, look ourselves at a mirror and learn to understand ourselves better. The concept of cruelty has two sides. It is a subjective concept used to define and describe those persons

and those acts that according to the user of the term are negative, harmful, humiliating, harsh, inhumane, primitive and unnatural; in everyday life it is associated with religious habits – with crude remnants of primitive religion, it is associated with passion, an uncontrolled mental state, or with violence and with the exercise of power without justice. On the other hand the term is used to classify people by their ethical and social habits, to accuse, to invalidate and injure others; therefore the accusation of cruelty refers to basic features of ancient and also Medieval thought, to the fear of anything foreign, to the aggressive curiosity to define and subsume others simply by their otherness.

Such were the considerations which gave inspiration for arranging the “cruelty”-seminar. The conference was accommodated by the Archipelago Institute of the University of Turku, in the island Seili (“Soul island”), in an environment of quiet beauty of the remote island and sad memories of the centuries when people attacked by a cruel fate, lepers or mentally ill, were banished there from the civilized community.

The conference was organized by the Department of Classics of the University of Turku in collaboration with the Departments of Cultural History and Italian language and culture of the same university. It is a pleasure to us to be able to thank here all those who helped to make the congress possible. We would like especially to express our gratitude to Luigi de Anna and Hannu Laaksonen for their assistance in preparing and carrying out the practical arrangements. The financial assistance given by the Finnish Academy and by the Turku University Foundation was also indispensable. Finally, we close by expressing our gratitude to Gerhard Jaritz, the editor of the *Medium Aevum Quotidianum* for the *Gesellschaft für Erforschung der materiellen Kultur des Mittelalters*, for his kind co-operation and for accepting this collection of papers to be published as a supplement to the series of the studies on the Medieval everyday life. One of the starting-points for organizing the “cruelty”-conference was the firm conviction that the Graeco-Roman Antiquity did not end with the beginning of the Middle Ages, but these two eras form a continuum in many respects, and the continuity was felt not only in the literary culture, in the Greek and Latin languages which were still used, but also in the political, social and religious structures of the Middle Ages. We think that this continuity is amply demonstrated by the studies of the present volume.

Department of Classics, University of Turku, Finland